

**Labor Market Analysis for Program Recommendation**

**Law Enforcement Occupations**

**City College of San Francisco**

## Prepared by the San Francisco Bay Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research

## May 2023

## Recommendation

Based on all available data, there appears to be an “undersupply” of Law Enforcement workers compared to the demand for this cluster of occupations in the Bay region and in the Mid-Peninsula sub-region (San Francisco, San Mateo counties). There is a projected annual gap of about 51 students in the Bay region and 256 students in the Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region.

However, if the majority of the 586 “low unit certificates” - which are likely for "in-service" training or "professional development" training for current police officers employed by local law enforcement agencies - are subtracted from the supply number, (since these awards do not represent new graduates looking for a job, but current workers) then there could be an annual undersupply in the region of up to 637 students.

## Introduction

This report provides student outcomes data on employment and earnings for TOP 2105.00 - Administration of Justice programs in the state and region. It is recommended that these data be reviewed to better understand how outcomes for students taking courses on this TOP code compare to potentially similar programs at colleges in the state and region, as well as to outcomes across all CTE programs at City College of San Francisco and in the region.

This report profiles Law Enforcement Occupations in the 12 county Bay region and in the Mid-Peninsula sub-region for a proposed new Law Enforcement Career Preparation certificate program at City College of San Francisco.

* **Police and Sheriff’s Patrol Officers (33-3051):** Maintain order and protect life and property by enforcing local, tribal, State, or Federal laws and ordinances. Perform a combination of the following duties: patrol a specific area; direct traffic; issue traffic summonses; investigate accidents; apprehend and arrest suspects, or serve legal processes of courts.
  Entry-Level Educational Requirement: High school diploma or equivalent
  Training Requirement: Moderate-term on-the-job training
  Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 49%
* **Public Safety Telecommunicators (43-5031):** Operate radio, telephone, or computer equipment at emergency response centers. Receive reports from the public of crimes, disturbances, fires, and medical or police emergencies. Relay information to law enforcement and emergency response personnel. May maintain contact with caller until responders arrive.
  Entry-Level Educational Requirement: High school diploma or equivalent
  Training Requirement: Moderate-term on-the-job training
  Percentage of Community College Award Holders or Some Postsecondary Coursework: 56%

## Occupational Demand

**Table 1. Employment Outlook for Law Enforcement Occupations in Bay Region**

| **Occupation** | **2021 Jobs** | **2026 Jobs** | **5-yr Change** | **5-yr % Change** | **5-yr Total Openings** | **Annual Openings** | **25% Hourly Earning** | **Median Hourly Wage** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers | 16,173 | 16,910 | 737 | 5% | 7,435 | 1,487 | $47 | $58 |
| Public Safety Telecommunicators | 1,969 | 2,084 | 114 | 6% | 1,165 | 233 | $36 | $42 |
| **Total** | **18,143** | **18,994** | **851** | **5%** | **8,600** | **1,720** |  |  |
| Source: Lightcast 2022.3 |
| **Bay Region includes:** Alameda, Contra Costa, Marin, Monterey, Napa, San Benito, San Francisco, San Mateo, Santa Clara, Santa Cruz, Solano and Sonoma Counties |

**Table 2. Employment Outlook for Law Enforcement Occupations in Mid-Peninsula Sub-region**

| **Occupation** | **2021 Jobs** | **2026 Jobs** | **5-yr Change** | **5-yr % Change** | **5-yr Total Openings** | **Annual Openings** | **25% Hourly Earning** | **Median Hourly Wage** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers | 4,329 | 4,433 | 104 | 2% | 1,882 | 376 | $50 | $63 |
| Public Safety Telecommunicators | 466 | 485 | 20 | 4% | 265 | 53 | $39 | $49 |
| **Total** | **4,795** | **4,918** | **123** | **3%** | **2,148** | **429** |  |  |
| Source: Lightcast 2022.3 |
| **Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region includes:** San Francisco, San Mateo Counties |

### Job Postings in Bay Region and Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region

**Table 3. Number of Job Postings by Occupation for latest 12 months (May 2022 - Apr. 2023)**

| **Occupation** | **Bay Region** | **Mid-Peninsula** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| Police and Sheriff's Patrol Officers | 682 | 152 |
| Public Safety Telecommunicators | 146 | 21 |
| Source: Lightcast |

**Table 4a. Top Job Titles for Law Enforcement Occupations for latest 12 months (May 2022 - Apr. 2023) Bay Region**

| **Title** | **Bay** | **Title** | **Bay** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Border Patrol Agents | 243 | Police Academy Instructors | 18 |
| Marine Interdiction Agents | 64 | Lateral Police Officers | 17 |
| Air Interdiction Agents | 56 | Deputy Sheriffs | 16 |
| Police Officers | 50 | Communications Dispatchers | 13 |
| Pilots | 49 | Community Service Officers | 12 |
| Dispatchers | 31 | Police Dispatchers | 11 |
| Public Safety Dispatchers | 26 | Law Enforcement Professionals | 9 |
| Public Safety Officers | 25 | Police Cadets | 9 |
| Military Police Officers | 19 | University Police Officers | 7 |
| Source: Lightcast |

**Table 4b. Top Job Titles for Law Enforcement Occupations for latest 12 months (May 2022 - Apr. 2023) Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region**

| **Title** | **Mid-Peninsula** | **Title** | **Mid-Peninsula** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Border Patrol Agents | 44 | Deputy Sheriffs | 4 |
| Public Safety Officers | 20 | Dispatchers | 4 |
| Police Officers | 12 | Lateral Police Officers | 4 |
| Air Interdiction Agents | 9 | Communications Dispatchers | 3 |
| Marine Interdiction Agents | 9 | Police Academy Instructors | 3 |
| Pilots | 8 | Safety Ambassadors | 3 |
| Military Police Officers | 5 | Special Response Officers | 3 |
| Public Safety Dispatchers | 5 | Action Officers | 2 |
| Special Police Officers | 5 | Courtesy Patrols | 2 |
| Source: Lightcast |

## Industry Concentration

**Table 5. Industries hiring Law Enforcement Workers in Bay Region**

| **Industry - 6 Digit NAICS (No. American Industry Classification) Codes** | **Jobs in Industry (2021)** | **Jobs in Industry (2026)** | **% Change (2021-26)** | **% Occupation Group in Industry (2022)** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Local Government, Excluding Education and Hospitals | 15,480 | 16,187 | 5% | 85% |
| State Government, Excluding Education and Hospitals | 795 | 831 | 4% | 4% |
| Federal Government, Military | 572 | 582 | 2% | 3% |
| Colleges, Universities, and Professional Schools (State Government) | 362 | 390 | 8% | 2% |
| Colleges, Universities, and Professional Schools | 264 | 299 | 13% | 1% |
| Colleges, Universities, and Professional Schools (Local Government) | 197 | 192 | -2% | 1% |
| Federal Government, Civilian, Excluding Postal Service | 132 | 131 | -1% | 1% |
| Ambulance Services | 114 | 126 | 11% | 1% |
| Elementary and Secondary Schools (Local Government) | 99 | 107 | 8% | 1% |
| General Medical and Surgical Hospitals | 35 | 35 | 2% | 0% |
| Source: Lightcast 2022.3 |

**Table 6. Top Employers Posting Law Enforcement Occupations in Bay Region and Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region (May 2022 - Apr. 2023)**

| **Employer** | **Bay** | **Employer** | **Mid-Peninsula** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| U.S. Customs And Border Protection | 393 | U.S. Customs and Border Protection | 57 |
| University of California | 18 | San Francisco Public Utilities Commission | 7 |
| TracyRecruiter.com | 11 | University of California | 7 |
| Liberty Healthcare Corporation | 9 | City Menlo Park | 5 |
| California State University | 8 | TracyRecruiter.com | 4 |
| City Of Napa | 8 | City Of Redwood City | 3 |
| San Francisco Public Utilities Commission | 7 | Federal Reserve Bank | 3 |
| Source: Lightcast |

## Educational Supply

There are 23 community colleges in the Bay Region issuing 1,669 awards on average annually (last 3 years ending 2019-20) on TOP 2105.00 - Administration of Justice. In the Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region, there are three (3) community colleges that issued 173 awards on average annually (last 3 years) on this TOP code.

**Table 7. Community College Awards on TOP 2105.00 - Administration of Justice in Bay Region**

| **College** | **Subregion** | **Associate Degree** | **High unit Certificate** | **Low unit Certificate** | **Total** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Cabrillo | SC-Monterey | 25 | 0 | 0 | 25 |
| Chabot  | East Bay | 56 | 0 | 0 | 56 |
| Contra Costa | East Bay | 27 | 0 | 7 | 34 |
| De Anza | Silicon Valley | 66 | 0 | 0 | 66 |
| Diablo Valley | East Bay | 93 | 0 | 42 | 135 |
| Evergreen Valley | Silicon Valley | 66 | 0 | 0 | 66 |
| Gavilan | Silicon Valley | 43 | 0 | 5 | 48 |
| Hartnell | SC-Monterey | 101 | 0 | 18 | 119 |
| Las Positas | East Bay | 35 | 0 | 0 | 35 |
| Los Medanos | East Bay | 59 | 0 | 16 | 75 |
| Marin | North Bay | 9 | 0 | 2 | 11 |
| Merritt | East Bay | 36 | 5 | 0 | 41 |
| Mission | Silicon Valley | 8 | 0 | 0 | 8 |
| Monterey | SC-Monterey | 32 | 0 | 113 | 145 |
| Napa | North Bay | 34 | 0 | 11 | 45 |
| Ohlone | East Bay | 20 | 0 | 0 | 20 |
| San Francisco | Mid-Peninsula | 45 | 21 | 12 | 78 |
| San Jose City | Silicon Valley | 31 | 0 | 8 | 39 |
| San Mateo | Mid-Peninsula | 53 | 0 | 8 | 61 |
| Santa Rosa | North Bay | 67 | 0 | 340 | 407 |
| Skyline | Mid-Peninsula | 32 | 0 | 2 | 34 |
| Solano | North Bay | 65 | 2 | 2 | 69 |
| West Valley | Silicon Valley | 52 | 0 | 0 | 52 |
| **Total** |  | **1,055** | **28** | **586** | **1,669** |
| Source: Data Mart |
| Note: The annual average for awards is 2017-18 to 2019-20. |

## Gap Analysis

Based on the data included in this report, there is a labor market gap in the Bay region with 1,720 annual openings for the Law Enforcement occupational cluster and 1,669 annual (3-year average) awards for an annual undersupply of 51 students. However, if the majority of the 586 “low unit certificates” - which are likely for "in-service" training or "professional development" training for current police officers employed by local law enforcement agencies - are subtracted from the supply number, (since these awards do not represent new graduates looking for a job, but current workers) then there could be an annual undersupply in the region of up to 637 students.

In the Mid-Peninsula Sub-Region, there is also a gap with 429 annual openings and 173 annual (3-year average) awards for an annual undersupply of 256 students.

## Student Outcomes

**Table 8. Four Employment Outcomes Metrics for Students Who Took Courses on TOP 2105.00 - Administration of Justice**

| **Metric Outcomes** | **Bay All CTE Programs** | **CCSF All CTE Programs** | **State 2105.00** | **Bay 2105.00** | **Mid-Peninsula 2105.00** | **CCSF 2105.00** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Students with a Job Closely Related to Their Field of Study | 74% | 73% | 56% | 55% | 44% | 50% |
| Median Annual Earnings for SWP Exiting Students | $48,926 | $57,224 | $43,755 | $61,690 | $44,526 | $52,716 |
| Median Change in Earnings for SWP Exiting Students | 23% | 18% | 19% | 21% | 44% | 35% |
| Exiting Students Who Attained the Living Wage | 50% | 47% | 58% | 60% | 35% | 45% |
| Source: Launchboard Strong Workforce Program Median of 2018 to 2021. |

## Skills, Certifications and Education

**Table 9. Top Skills for Law Enforcement Occupations in Bay Region (May 2022 - Apr. 2023)**

| **Skill** | **Posting** | **Skill** | **Posting** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Law Enforcement | 385 | Information Systems | 122 |
| Border Control | 314 | American Institute Of Architects | 112 |
| Contraband Detection And Control | 194 | Aviation | 112 |
| Rehabilitation | 177 | Federal Aviation Administration | 111 |
| All Terrain Vehicles | 172 | IBM WebSphere MQ | 111 |
| Structured Interview | 165 | Multi-Engine Land | 110 |
| Workplace Safety | 157 | Rotorcraft | 109 |
| Law Enforcement Operations | 155 | Unmanned Aerial Systems (UAS) | 108 |
| Misdemeanor | 132 | Code Enforcement | 104 |
| Criminal Justice | 123 | Forensic Psychology | 102 |
| Source: Lightcast |

**Table 10. Certifications for Law Enforcement Occupations in Bay Region (May 2022 - Apr. 2023)**

| **Certification** | **Posting** | **Certification** | **Posting** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Valid Driver's License | 322 | Typing Certification | 9 |
| Airline Transport Pilot Licence | 111 | Emergency Medical Technician (EMT) | 7 |
| FAA Instrument Rating | 111 | Advanced Life Support | 6 |
| Operator Of Uninspected Passenger Vessels (OUPV) License | 74 | Emergency Medical Dispatcher (EMD) Certification | 6 |
| Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation (CPR) Certification | 39 | Automated External Defibrillator (AED) Certification | 5 |
| First Aid Certification | 34 | Basic POST Certificate | 5 |
| Peace Officer Standards And Training (POST) Certificate | 23 | Peace Officer Certification | 5 |
| CDL Class C License | 20 | Certified First Responder (CFR) | 4 |
| Basic Life Support (BLS) Certification | 14 | Certified Loss Control Specialist | 3 |
| Security Clearance | 12 | Change Management Certification | 3 |
| Source: Lightcast |

**Table 11. Education Requirements for Law Enforcement Occupations in Bay Region**

| **Education Level** | **Job Postings** | **% of Total** |
| --- | --- | --- |
| High school or GED | 227 | 34% |
| Associate degree | 25 | 4% |
| Bachelor's degree & higher | 412 | 62% |
| Source: Lightcast |
| Note: 47% of records have been excluded because they do not include a degree level. As a result, the chart above may not be representative of the full sample. |

## Methodology

Occupations for this report were identified by use of job descriptions and skills listed in O\*Net. Labor demand data is sourced from Lightcast occupation and job postings data. Educational supply and student outcomes data is retrieved from multiple sources, including CCCCO Data Mart and CTE Launchboard.

## Sources

O\*Net Online
Lightcast
CTE LaunchBoard www.calpassplus.org
Launchboard
Statewide CTE Outcomes Survey
Employment Development Department Unemployment Insurance Dataset
Living Insight Center for Community Economic Development
Chancellor’s Office MIS system

## Contacts

For more information, please contact:

* Leila Jamoosian, Research Analyst, for Bay Area Community College Consortium (BACCC) and Centers of Excellence (COE), leila@baccc.net
* John Carrese, Director, San Francisco Bay Center of Excellence for Labor Market Research, jcarrese@ccsf.edu or (415) 267-6544